

**Health impact assessment (HIA) of the lunchtime  
experience at Eastbank Academy, Glasgow**

**30<sup>th</sup> October 2007**



**Commissioned by the Glasgow Centre for Population Health**

***HIA Assessor and Report Author:***

**Erica Ison**

**Specialist Practitioner in HIA**

**Affiliated to the Public Health Resource Unit, Oxford**

**Expert Adviser in HIA to the World Health Organization (WHO) Healthy Cities and  
Urban Governance Programme**

***Project Management:***

**Fiona Crawford, Glasgow Centre for Population Health (GCPH)**

**David Parry, Direct and Care Services (DACs), Glasgow City Council**

***Project Support:***

**Russell Jones, Glasgow Centre for Population Health (GCPH)**

**Ruth Kendall, NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde**

**Helena Hailstone, Direct and Care Services (DACs), Glasgow City Council**

## Contents

|                   |  | Page      |
|-------------------|--|-----------|
|                   | <b>Acknowledgements</b>  | <b>3</b>  |
|                   | <b>List of Tables and Figures</b>  | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>1</b>          | <b>Introduction</b>  | <b>5</b>  |
| 1.1               | Background   | 5         |
| 1.2               | Introduction to health impact assessment   | 6         |
| 1.3               | Aims, objectives and values of the HIA   | 6         |
| 1.4               | Methodology  | 7         |
| 1.5               | Context for the HIA of the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy  | 8         |
|                   |  |           |
| <b>2</b>          | <b>Results of impact identification covering lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy</b>                            | <b>11</b> |
| 2.1               | Introduction   | 11        |
| 2.2               | Potential impacts on pupils  | 11        |
| 2.3               | Potential impacts on teaching staff  | 15        |
| 2.4               | Potential impacts on catering staff  | 17        |
| 2.5               | Potential impacts on the local community, including businesses   | 17        |
| 2.6               | Potential impacts on parents   | 19        |
| 2.7               | Discussion   | 20        |
| 2.8               | Conclusions  | 22        |
|                   |  |           |
| <b>3</b>          | <b>Stakeholder suggestions to improve health and well-being through the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy</b> | <b>23</b> |
| 3.1               | Introduction   | 23        |
| 3.2               | Suggestions that pupils did not think would work with respect to the experience of eating in school                  | 23        |
|                   |  |           |
| <b>4</b>          | <b>Assessor's observations</b>   | <b>27</b> |
| 4.1               | Areas of agreement about eating in school  | 29        |
| 4.2               | Areas of disagreement  | 31        |
| 4.3               | Recommendations to improve the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy  | 32        |
| <b>Appendices</b> |  |           |
|                   |  |           |
| <b>Appendix 1</b> | Parameters of the rapid literature review and documents analysed   | 33        |
| <b>Appendix 2</b> | Results of rapid literature review:  |           |
|                   | i) What influences whether children and young people (and parents/carers) make healthy choices about food?           | 35        |
|                   | ii) What has been done to help children and young people (and their parents/carers) make healthy choices about food? | 36        |
| <b>Appendix 3</b> | HIA programme  | 38        |
| <b>Appendix 4</b> | Stakeholder responses to the task "How does food affect your health?"  | 39        |

## **Acknowledgments**

### **A big thank you to:**

- The pupils, teachers, catering staff, parents of Eastbank Academy and other stakeholders for their willingness to participate in the health impact assessment, their honesty and their good ideas
- The staff of Glasgow City Council's Direct and Care Services and Education Services who helped to plan, organise and deliver the event
- The HIA assessor, Erica Ison, for her expert facilitation of the event and for her distillation of the findings
- All those who facilitated workshops
- Fiona Boyce, team secretary in GCPH for administrative support

## List of Tables and Figures

|  | Page      |
|--|-----------|
| <b>Box 1.1: Tasks undertaken in the HIA stakeholder workshop</b>   | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>Box 1.2: Challenges associated with Eastbank Academy in general, as identified by HIA workshop participants, which could affect what pupils do at lunchtime</b>   | <b>10</b> |
| <b>Box 1.3: Strengths of Eastbank Academy identified by workshop participants, which could be used to enhance the lunchtime experience</b>   | <b>11</b> |
| <b>Table 2.1: Potential impacts on pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>staying in</u> for school meals at lunchtime, according to issues identified by pupils, staff and others</b>  | <b>12</b> |
| <b>Table 2.2: Outcomes for health and well-being of pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>staying in</u> for school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by pupils</b>  | <b>12</b> |
| <b>Table 2.3: Additional potential impacts on health and well-being for pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>staying in</u> for school meals at lunchtime, as identified by staff and others</b>                                      | <b>13</b> |
| <b>Table 2.4: Potential impacts on pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>going out</u> to eat at lunchtime identified by pupils, staff and others</b>  | <b>14</b> |
| <b>Table 2.5: Outcomes for health and well-being of pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>going out</u> to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by pupils</b>   | <b>14</b> |
| <b>Table 2.6: Additional potential impacts on health and well-being for pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>going out</u> to eat at lunchtime, identified by staff and other stakeholders</b>  | <b>15</b> |
| <b>Table 2.7: Potential impacts for teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>stay in</u> for school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others</b>   | <b>15</b> |
| <b>Table 2.8: Outcomes for health and well-being of teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>stay in</u> for school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others</b>                           | <b>16</b> |
| <b>Table 2.9: Potential impacts on teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>go out</u> to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff</b>  | <b>16</b> |
| <b>Table 2.10: Outcomes for health and well-being of teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>go out</u> to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff</b>  | <b>16</b> |
| <b>Table 2.11: Outcomes for health and well-being of catering staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>stay in</u> to eat school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others</b>                       | <b>17</b> |
| <b>Table 2.12: Outcomes for health and well-being of catering staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>go out</u> to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others</b>                                     | <b>17</b> |
| <b>Table 2.13: Outcomes for health and well-being of local community including businesses if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>stay in</u> to eat school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others</b> | <b>18</b> |
| <b>Table 2.14: Outcomes for health and well-being of local community, including businesses, if pupils at Eastbank Academy <u>go out</u> to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others</b>             | <b>19</b> |
| <b>Table 3.1: Stakeholder suggestions to enhance health and well-being of pupils eating school meals</b>   | <b>24</b> |
| <b>Table 3.2: Stakeholder suggestions to enhance health and well-being of pupils who eat out at lunchtime</b>  | <b>27</b> |

# 1. Introduction

## 1.1 Background

There is evidence that improvement in nutrition-related health in children in economically developed countries can be achieved through the provision of healthier school meals. Moreover, healthy school food policy and practice provides an important vehicle to develop children and young people's understanding and motivation regarding healthy eating<sup>1</sup>. Healthy food and improved nutrition can improve learning ability and may also contribute to improved attainment and behaviour.<sup>2</sup> In contrast, children fed a monotonous diet of poor-quality, predominantly processed food do not thrive.<sup>3</sup>

Recent legislation in the form of the School (Health Promotion and Nutrition) (Scotland) Act which was passed by the Scottish Parliament on 14 March 2007 provides further impetus to improve school nutrition policy.<sup>4</sup> This legislation:

- Places health promotion at the heart of schools' activities;
- Ensures that food and drink served in schools (including school lunches, tuck shops, breakfast and after school clubs and vending machines) meets tough nutritional standards;
- Ensures local authorities promote the uptake and benefits of school meals and free school meals;
- Reduces the stigma associated with free school meals by requiring local authorities to protect the identity of those eligible;
- Gives local authorities the power to provide pupils with healthy snacks and drinks (either at cost or free of charge);
- Requires local authorities to consider sustainable development when they provide food or drink in schools.

Scotland is one of a few Western countries that have introduced compulsory nutrient-based standards for school meals through the enactment of the Schools (Health Promotion and Nutrition) Act 2007.<sup>4</sup> Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) is monitoring the implementation of these standards.<sup>5</sup> In passing this legislation, the Scottish Government recognises that healthy school food policy can help to drive forward other key policies, including social inclusion, educational attainment, the wider health promotion agenda and sustainable development.

Further relevant evidence and information identified through a rapid literature review is outlined in Appendices 1 and 2.

---

<sup>1</sup> Scottish Government. Healthy Eating, Active Living: An action plan to improve diet, increase physical activity and tackle obesity (2008-2011) Edinburgh: HMSO, 2008.

<sup>2</sup> World Health Organisation. Healthy Nutrition: An Essential Element of a Health- Promoting School. Geneva: World Health Organisation, 1998. [http://www.who.int/school\\_youth\\_health/media/en/428.pdf](http://www.who.int/school_youth_health/media/en/428.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> Scottish Office. The Scottish Diet. Report of the working group (the James report). Edinburgh: Scottish Office: 1999.

<sup>4</sup> Scottish Parliament. *Schools (Health Promotion and Nutrition) (Scotland) Bill*. 68B. Edinburgh: HMSO, 2007.

<sup>4</sup> Scottish Parliament. *Schools (Health Promotion and Nutrition) (Scotland) Bill*. 68B. Edinburgh: HMSO, 2007.

<sup>5</sup> Scottish Government. Schools (Health Promotion and Nutrition) Scotland Act: Health Promotion guidance for local authorities and schools. Edinburgh: Scottish Government. 2008. <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2008/05/08160456/0>

## 1.2 Introduction to health impact assessment

Health impact assessment (HIA) has been defined as: "...a combination of procedures, methods and tools by which a policy, programme or project may be judged as to its potential effects on the health of a population and the distribution of effects within the population".<sup>6</sup>

HIA is undertaken with the purpose of giving decision-makers information about the effects on health and well-being of a specific proposal, and supporting that information with suggestions about how to change and modify the proposal in order to achieve or optimise health gain through:

- Health protection – minimising or avoiding any negative or harmful effects;
- Health improvement – maximising or enhancing any positive or beneficial effects;
- Reducing health inequalities – working with the principle of equity.

In HIA, the effects on health and well-being can be identified using both biomedical and social models of health. An HIA can be conducted at various points in the development and implementation of a proposal: prospective HIAs are undertaken before a proposal has been implemented, and concurrent HIAs are undertaken while a proposal is being implemented. For this HIA, the starting point for the investigation was not a document outlining the proposal, but **the existing situation during the lunch break at Eastbank Academy**. Therefore, a concurrent HIA was undertaken of the lunchtime experience of pupils at Eastbank Academy.

## 1.3 Aims, objectives and values of the HIA

### Aims:

- To identify the impacts of school meal provision at Eastbank Academy on health and well-being of pupils and staff;
- To identify the impacts on health and well-being of obtaining lunch outside school for pupils at Eastbank Academy, staff and the local community including businesses;
- To identify ways to increase any benefits of school meal provision at Eastbank Academy on pupils' health and well-being;
- To identify ways to increase the uptake of school meal provision at Eastbank Academy based on the benefits to health and well-being;
- To identify ways to improve pupils' health and well-being through eating out at lunchtime.

### Objectives:

- To undertake rapid document analysis of key policies and plans relating to school meal provision in Scotland;
- To undertake a rapid search for readily available information from the published literature on the health impacts of school meal provision;
- To undertake a rapid search for readily available case-studies of HIAs of school meal provision;
- To run a stakeholder workshop including representatives from pupils, pupils' families, staff and local businesses to identify impacts on health and well-being of school and non-school meal provision, and ways to address those impacts;
- To disseminate the results of the HIA to pupils, their families and staff in appropriate ways;
- To present the results of the HIA to those responsible for making decisions about the school meals service.

### Values:

- Child health protection and improvement;
- Social inclusion;
- Equity, particularly in relation to child poverty.

---

<sup>6</sup> World Health Organisation. Health Impact Assessment: main concepts and suggested approach. Gothenburg Consensus Paper. Geneva: WHO, 1999 <http://www.euro.who.int/document/PAE/Gothenburgpaper.pdf>

## 1.4 Methodology

A rapid review of available literature and policies was undertaken as a first step. Documents were analysed to identify factors that influence whether children and young people make healthy choices about food while attending school and interventions that have been used or recommended to encourage children and young people to make healthy choices about food while attending school. A list of documents analysed and results of analysis are presented in Appendices 1 and 2. This evidence was used to inform the planning and conduct of the HIA.

A site visit to the Eastbank Academy dining area and Shettleston Road during school lunch break was organised and a planning meeting with senior GCC education, catering staff and public health staff followed this to discuss and agree the aims, objectives and format of the HIA. A participatory stakeholder workshop for representatives of Eastbank Academy pupils, teaching staff, catering staff, parents/carers, and other stakeholders was held on the 30<sup>th</sup> October 2007. The programme for the day is provided in Appendix 3.

Participants consisted of: sixteen pupils comprising representatives from each year group as well as the Head Boy and Girl; four members of teaching staff, six members of Direct and Care Services staff, two of whom were also parents of pupils in the school and six public health staff, three of whom assisted with facilitation of group work. Food retailers were invited but were not represented on the day.

After a short introduction by the facilitator, outlining general principles of an HIA and the aims and objectives of this HIA of the lunchtime experience, the programme involved plenary and small group exercises to explore:

- Perceptions around food, its effect on health and how it relates to other factors that affect health;
- Views of participants on why young people leave school to purchase lunch;
- The impacts on health of the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy;
- Identification of ways to increase the health benefits from the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy, and ways to reduce what people see as disadvantages.

The final session of the day involved a discussion about how the results of the HIA could be taken forward by Direct and Care Services and the school.

### **Box 1.1:** Tasks undertaken in the HIA stakeholder workshop

#### *Formal questions*

- What are the strengths of Eastbank Academy?
- What are the challenges faced by Eastbank Academy?
- How does food affect health?
- Why don't young people eat school meals and go elsewhere?
- What are the impacts on health of the lunchtime experience?
- What can be done to increase the positive impacts and decrease the negative impacts of the lunchtime experience?

#### *Informal questions*

- What did you eat for breakfast? What is your favourite food?

The target group for the proposal was pupils attending Eastbank Academy in Glasgow. However, the potential impacts on health and well-being of the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy were identified for several other groups as well as the pupils, including:

- Teaching staff;
- Catering staff;
- Local businesses;
- Members of the community living in the vicinity of Eastbank Academy.

Participants were also asked to consider parents and carers.

## 1.5 Context for the HIA of the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy

### **General context**

Eastbank Academy is a state-funded secondary school, described as an integrated community school. During September 2006, there were 1,256 pupils and 105.6 teachers in terms of full-time equivalents (FTE) at Eastbank Academy<sup>7</sup>. The districts in Glasgow served by Eastbank Academy are: Parkhead; Greenfield; Tollcross; Shettleston; Sandyhills; Springboig; Dalmarnock; Bridgeton. Eastbank Academy draws pupils from the following primary schools: Dalmarnock Primary School; Eastbank Primary School; Quarry Brae Primary School; Thorntree Primary School; Wellshot Primary School.<sup>8</sup>

There is an induction programme for S1 pupils. In 1999, the school became part of a “Learning Community” pilot with its associated primary schools and pre-school centres. It has now been established as the Eastbank New Learning Community. The school also has strong links with Newhills Special School. Eastbank Academy has Health Promoting School status, and it is also a pilot site for the first Community Club Initiative set up by Culture and Sport Glasgow. There is a senior pupil council, a parents’ council, a parents’ forum and a parent-teacher association.

### **Specific context at lunchtime**

The lunch break is 45 minutes and pupils are allowed to leave school premises. Although the morning break is only 15 minutes, pupils are also allowed to leave school premises at this point in the school day.

According to Glasgow City Council data, over two-thirds (68.4%) of pupils at Eastbank Academy eat out at lunchtime and consume their lunch on the street, compared with less than one-tenth of pupils who stay in to eat a school meal in the dining area (9.1%). Almost 5% of pupils go home to eat lunch (4.4%), just over 3% of pupils eat in the playground (3.1%), just under 4% of pupils eat elsewhere in the school (3.9%) and almost 10% eat “somewhere else” (not specified). At present, when pupils go out to eat at lunchtime, there are no staff members supervising this activity.

There is insufficient physical space for all the pupils at Eastbank Academy to eat in the dining area at lunchtime. In an HMiE report, published in 2001, the dining facilities were described as “limited”. “Social areas” in the school were also described as “limited”.<sup>9</sup> There appears to have been no change to this assessment in the follow-up report, 2 years later.<sup>10</sup>

Apart from the limited space available, the dining area is sited very close to the main entrance to the school and on a major thoroughfare. The acoustics of this main corridor are poor, and the combination of the ceiling and the activity along the corridor make it a very noisy and crowded environment, which was variously described by workshop participants as: “*cramped*”; “*people running about*”; “*feel engulfed by people and noise*”; “*too warm sometimes*”; “*bad atmosphere*”; “*tension on wet days*.”

There is a culture of pupils leaving the school at lunchtime. For some pupils, staying in was seen as “*boring*.” Staff accepted that, at present, the lunchtime experience in school is “*not what kids want*,” and there is a wide range of food vending sites in close proximity to the school, particularly on Shettleston Road, which from commercial interests are prepared to meet what the pupils want.

---

<sup>7</sup> Scottish Schools Online 2006. Eastbank Academy.

<http://www.scottishschoolsonline.gov.uk/schools/eastbankacademyglasgowcity.asp?view=print>

<sup>8</sup> Eastbank Academy website <http://www.eastbankacademy.org.uk/phpSite/index.php>.

<sup>9</sup> Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) Inspection of Standards and Quality in Eastbank Academy, Glasgow City Council. 17 April 2001.

<sup>10</sup> Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) Follow-up to the Inspection of Eastbank Academy, Glasgow City Council 25 March 2003.

Indeed, some of these sites provide lunchtime menus aimed at the pupils. As one pupil said “*There are no chips and curry sauce in school.*”

Direct and Care Services (DACS) of Glasgow City Council, who provide the school meals service utilise the uptake of free meals as an indicator of the use of the school meals service in general. Free school meal uptake in Scotland is 67.5%. Eligibility is 16% nationally.<sup>11</sup> There has been a significant drop in uptake since the introduction of the new menu in autumn 2006, and for this academic year (2007-2008), there have been a greater number of first year pupils not taking school meals at lunchtime than previously. This drop in the uptake of free meals at Eastbank Academy requires attention given that Glasgow City Council are committed to maximising the uptake of entitlements to free school meals.<sup>12</sup> At Eastbank Academy, over a third of pupils were registered for free meals (34.6% in 2006-2007), a figure that is almost 4% higher than that for Glasgow as a whole (30.9%) and more than double that for Scotland (13.2%).

### **Challenges faced by Eastbank Academy**

Workshop participants were asked about the challenges faced by Eastbank Academy. Responses fell into one of two broad categories: a) responses about the lunchtime experience; b) responses about the school in general.

Challenges that participants felt needed to be addressed with respect to the lunchtime experience include:

- The lunchtime experience itself;
- The large number of pupils who go out at lunchtime and do not use the school meals service/dining room;
- The dining room environment, including the amount of space available;
- The lack of a common room in which 6<sup>th</sup> year pupils can eat;
- The small number of vegetarian options;
- The fact that some of the food in school is not considered healthy;
- With the self-service buffet-style of service, pupils’ concern about hygiene and the potential for other pupils to finger the food.

Issues identified as challenges that exacerbate poor uptake of school meals at Eastbank Academy include the geographical location of the school next to Shettleston Road that includes a large number of shops and other food outlets in close proximity to the school, and the competition they pose to the school meals service.

Challenges associated with the school in general are shown in Box 1.2. Addressing some of these issues may help to improve the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy either directly, such as tackling the lack of space, or indirectly, such as addressing bullying and the impact of peer pressure.

---

<sup>11</sup> <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/News/Releases/2007/06/05104224>

<sup>12</sup> Glasgow City Council (2004) Food and Health Policy for Schools.

| <b>Box 1.2: Challenges associated with Eastbank Academy in general, as identified by HIA workshop participants, which could affect what pupils do at lunchtime</b>      |   |   |
|---|---|---|
| <p><b>School environment</b></p> <p>School accommodation<br/>Lack of space<br/>Lack of facilities<br/>Lack of equipment<br/>Large amount of waste in school grounds</p> | <p><b>Pupil behaviour and attitudes</b></p> <p>Apathy<br/>Fights among some pupils<br/>Bullying by some pupils<br/>Poor attendance by some pupils<br/>Attitude of some pupils<br/>Behaviour of a minority of pupils<br/>Misuse of mobile 'phones in class by pupils</p> | <p><b>Parental behaviour and attitudes</b></p> <p>Apathy on behalf of some parents</p>                          |
| <p><b>School activities and timetabling</b></p> <p>Small number of school trips<br/>Time constraints/lack of time to develop projects<br/>Length of school day</p>      | <p><b>Teaching staff behaviour and attitudes</b></p> <p>Attitude of some teachers</p>   | <p><b>Wider social influences</b></p> <p>Social context<br/>Bad influences outside school<br/>Peer pressure</p> |

### **Strengths of Eastbank Academy**

Workshop participants were asked to identify the strengths of Eastbank Academy. Again, responses fell into one of two broad categories:

1. Responses regarding the lunchtime experience;
2. Responses regarding the school in general.

The strengths that could be built upon to improve the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy include: a hard-working catering team; food production on site; the choice on the menu in terms of the range of food; the provision of both hot and cold food; the selection of healthy foods including salad; the uptake and promotion of healthy eating through school meals; the low cost of lunch; the provision of a cold-water dispenser; a rewards system for eating healthily; some initiatives on food; canvassing pupils' opinion on school meals.

Strengths of the school, in general, are shown in Box 1.3, some of which could also be built upon to enhance the lunchtime experience, for example, the strong links with the community, and the status of Eastbank Academy as a Health Promoting School.

| <b>Box 1.3: Strengths of Eastbank Academy identified by workshop participants, which could be used to enhance the lunchtime experience</b>   |  |   |
|--|--|---|
| <p><b>School ethos</b></p> <p>Strong links with the community<br/>Community spirit<br/>Community work<br/>Caring ethos<br/>Welcome given to newcomers and visitors to the school<br/>Sticking together (“big and small”)</p> | <p><b>Staff and pupils</b></p> <p>Inspirational staff<br/>Pupils</p>   | <p><b>Pupil support</b></p> <p>Support from Senior Management Team, health and other development officers, and police<br/>Pastoral care for pupils<br/>Respect given to pupils<br/>The buddy system for 1st years</p> |
| <p><b>School facilities</b></p> <p>Up-to-date school equipment<br/>Good education system</p>   | <p><b>Whole School Approach</b></p> <p>Health Promoting School<br/>After-school activities<br/>Large number of school clubs<br/>Pupil involvement in extra-curricular activities</p> |   |

## **2. Results of impact identification covering the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy**

### **2.1 Introduction**

The potential impacts on health and well-being of the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy were identified for the following groups:

- Pupils;
- Teaching staff;
- Catering staff;
- Local community including businesses.

A few impacts on parents and carers were also identified.

For each group, potential impacts on health and well-being were identified for two main situations:

1. Pupils staying in to eat school meals at lunchtime;
2. Pupils going out to eat at lunchtime.

### **2.2 Potential impacts on pupils**

For this section of the report, the potential impacts on pupils have been recorded according to the following structure:

- An impacts table that shows the issues pupils identified as important – within this impacts table, the responses of the pupils, staff and other stakeholders have been recorded: beneficial or positive impacts are represented by happy face symbols, harmful or negative impacts by sad face symbols;
- An outcomes table that show the issues identified as important by the pupils and the potential effects and outcomes on health and well-being;
- An impacts and outcomes table combined, based on additional influences identified by the staff and other stakeholders (i.e. they were not mentioned by the pupils)

### **Staying in for school meals**

The pupils identified a number of issues in relation to staying in to eat school meals at lunchtime. The results of whether pupils considered these to be beneficial or harmful are shown in Table 2.1. The effects and outcomes of these issues on pupils' health and well-being are shown in Table 2.2, and in Table 2.3, additional influences identified by staff and other stakeholders are set out together with the potential effects on and outcomes for pupils' health and well-being.

**Table 2.1: Potential impacts on pupils at Eastbank Academy staying in for school meals at lunchtime, according to issues identified by pupils, staff and others**

|                              | <b>Pupils</b> | <b>Staff</b> | <b>Others</b> |
|------------------------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|
| <b>Time available to eat</b> | ☺             |              |               |
| <b>Convenience</b>           |               |              |               |
| <b>Personal safety</b>       |               | ☺            | ☺             |
| <b>Temperature levels</b>    | ☹             |              |               |
| <b>Noise levels</b>          |               | ☹            | ☹             |
| <b>Degree of crowding</b>    |               | ☹            | ☹             |
| <b>Seating and tables</b>    |               | ☹            | ☹             |
| <b>Diet</b>                  | ☺             |              | ☺             |
| <b>Hygiene</b>               | ☹             | ☹            | ☺             |
| <b>Supervisory presence</b>  | ☹             | ☺            | ☹             |
| <b>Pupil behaviour</b>       | ☹             |              |               |

**Table 2.2: Outcomes for health and well-being of pupils at Eastbank Academy staying in for school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by pupils**

| <b>Issue</b>          | <b>Effects</b>  | <b>Outcome(s) for pupils</b>                               |
|-----------------------|---|--|
| Time available to eat | Reduced levels of stress<br>Improved digestion  | Increased mental and physical well-being                   |
| Convenience           | Reduced levels of stress  |  |
| Personal safety       | Reduced levels of stress<br>Reduced risk of bullying and risk of injury from fighting |  |
| Diet                  | Choice of healthy foods<br>Improved nutrition   |  |
| Temperature           | Discomfort from high temperatures   | Decreased mental and physical well-being                   |
| Noise levels          | Increased stress from high noise levels   |  |
| Crowding              | Increased levels of stress<br>Increased risk of accidents                             |  |
| Seating and tables    | Increased discomfort and stress<br>Reduced social interaction                         | Decreased mental well-being<br>Potential risk of infection |
| Hygiene               | Contamination of food   |  |
| Supervisory presence  | Increased levels of stress  |  |
| Pupil behaviour       | Increased levels of stress  | Decreased mental well-being                                |

**Table 2.3: Additional potential impacts on health and well-being for pupils at Eastbank Academy staying in for school meals at lunchtime, as identified by staff and others**

| <b>Issue</b>                          | <b>Effects</b>   | <b>Outcomes for pupils</b>               |
|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| Social contact                        | Increased levels of social support and development of social skills  | Increased mental well-being              |
| Opportunity to access a social space  | Increased opportunity for relaxation<br>Reduced levels of stress   |  |
| Value for money                       | Increased levels of satisfaction   |  |
| Exposure to role models/good examples | Improved health-related behaviour and social skills  | Increased mental and physical well-being |
| Access to teaching staff              | Improved personal safety<br>Reduced risk of being a victim of bullying and injury from fighting  |  |
| Access to school nurse                | Reduced levels of anxiety and stress   |  |
| Opportunity to access school clubs    | Increased levels of social support, knowledge and development of social skills; increased physical activity  |  |
| Quality of indoor environment         | Increased levels of stress   | Decreased mental well-being              |
| Reduced exposure to weather           | Reduced exposure to ultraviolet light<br>Reduced production of Vitamin D   | Decreased mental and physical well-being |
| Access to incentive system (Q card)   | Difficulty using complex system leading to increased stress and greater likelihood of pupils leaving school to purchase lunch                        |  |
| Lack of opportunity to use cash       | Increased difficulty paying for school meals leading to increased levels of stress and greater likelihood of pupils leaving school to purchase lunch |  |

### ***Going out to eat at lunchtime***

Pupils identified a number of issues that they thought would be affected if they go out to eat at lunchtime.

The results of whether pupils considered these to be beneficial or harmful are shown in Table 2.4. The effects and outcomes of these issues on pupils' health and well-being are shown in Table 2.5, and in Table 2.6, additional influences identified by staff and other stakeholders are set out together with the effects on, and outcomes for, pupils' health and well-being.

**Table 2.4: Potential impacts on pupils at Eastbank Academy going out to eat at lunchtime identified by pupils, staff and others**

|  | <i>Pupils</i> | <i>Staff</i> | <i>Others</i> |
|--|---------------|--------------|---------------|
| Ability to leave the school                | ☺             |              |               |
| The opportunity to exercise                | ☺             |              | ☺             |
| The degree of freedom experienced          | ☺             |              | ☺             |
| Social contact with friends                | ☺             | ☺            | ☺             |
| The choice of food and drinks              | ☺ ☹           | ☺            | ☺             |
| The cost of food                           | ☺             |              |               |
| Value for money                            | ☺             |              |               |
| Diet                                       | ☹             |              | ☹             |
| Food hygiene                               | ☹             |              | ☹             |
| Personal safety                            | ☹             | ☹            | ☹             |
| Quality of food vending sites              | ☹             |              |               |
| Exposure to weather                        | ☹             |              | ☺             |
| Quality of non-school external environment | ☹             |              |               |

**Table 2.5: Outcomes for health and well-being of pupils at Eastbank Academy going out to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by pupils**

| <i>Issue</i>                    | <i>Effects</i>   | <i>Outcomes for pupils</i>   |
|---------------------------------|--|--|
| Degree of freedom               | Increased feelings of independence, self-esteem and confidence   | Increased mental well-being  |
| Social contact with friends     | Potential for increased social skills and emotional support  |  |
| Cost                            | Increased feelings of independence/control   |  |
| Value for money                 | Reduced levels of waste<br>Reduced levels of stress  |  |
| Ability to leave school         | Opportunity to relax in different environment and be physically active   | Increased mental and physical well-being   |
| Choice of food and drinks       | <i>If make healthy choices</i><br>Increased feelings of control<br><br><i>If make unhealthy choices:</i><br>guilt, nausea, hyperactivity | <i>If make healthy choices</i><br>Increased mental well-being<br><br><i>If make unhealthy choices:</i><br>decreased mental and physical well-being |
| Diet                            | Increased intake of fat, sugar and salt  | Decreased mental and physical well-being   |
| Personal safety                 | Increased risk of being a victim of bullying, increased risk of injury from fighting and/or road traffic accidents                       |  |
| Food hygiene                    | Increased risk of food-related infection   | Decreased physical well-being  |
| <i>Issue</i>                    | <i>Effects</i>   | <i>Outcomes for pupils</i>   |
| Bad weather                     | Exposure to poor weather - wind, cold, rain and snow   | Decreased physical well-being (increased risk of respiratory tract infections)   |
| Good weather                    | Exposure to sunshine and fresh air   | Increased mental and physical well-being   |
| Unpleasant external environment | Increased levels of stress   | Decreased mental well-being  |

**Table 2.6: Additional potential impacts on health and well-being for pupils at Eastbank Academy going out to eat at lunchtime, identified by staff and other stakeholders**

| <b>Issue</b>                               | <b>Effects</b>   | <b>Outcomes for pupils</b>  |
|--|--|---|
| Pupil behaviour outside school             | Littering<br>Antisocial behaviour by some pupils<br>Negative image and reputation of school in community<br>Low school morale<br>Loss of self-esteem | Decreased mental well-being   |
| Opportunity for pupils to smoke            | Increased levels of relaxation<br>Feeling of achieving adulthood<br>Increased acceptance by peer group<br>Inhalation of tobacco smoke                | <i>Short-term effects</i><br>Increased mental well-being              |
|  |  | <i>Long-term effects</i><br>Increased risk of smoking related disease |
| Conditions for pupils who eat school meals | Improved conditions with respect to crowding and noise levels<br>Reduced levels of stress  | Increased mental well-being   |

## 2.3 Potential impacts on teaching staff

For this section of the report, the impacts on teaching staff have been recorded according to the following structure:

- An impacts table that shows the issues identified as important by staff and other stakeholders – within this impacts table, the responses of the staff and other stakeholders have been recorded: beneficial or positive impacts are shown by happy face symbols and harmful or negative impacts are shown by sad face symbols;
- An outcomes table that records the potential effects and outcomes on teachers' health and well-being of those issues thought to be important.

### ***Pupils staying in for school meals***

Staff and other stakeholders identified a number of issues they thought affected teaching staff if pupils stay in to eat school meals at lunchtime. The results of whether these were considered to be beneficial or harmful are shown in Table 2.7, the effects and outcomes of these issues on teachers' health and well-being are shown in Table 2.8.

**Table 2.7: Potential impacts for teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy stay in for school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others**

|   | <b>Staff</b> | <b>Others</b> |
|---|--------------|---------------|
| Noise levels                                      | ☹            |               |
| Availability of separate space for teaching staff | ☹            |               |
| Provision of free meals during supervision        | ☺            |               |
| Pupils having access to supervisors               | ☹            | ☹             |
| The need to address problems during supervision   | ☹            | ☹             |
| Availability of staff for supervision             | ☹            |               |
| Pupil punctuality for afternoon lessons           | ☺            |               |

**Table 2.8: Outcomes for health and well-being of teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy stay in for school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others**

| <i>Issue</i>  | <i>Effects</i>  | <i>Outcomes for teaching staff</i> |
|---|---|------------------------------------|
| Provision of free meal during supervision                 | Increased amount of disposable income   | Increased mental well-being        |
| Pupil punctuality for lessons                             | Reduced stress and Increased staff morale   |                                    |
| Noise levels  | Increased levels of stress<br>Inability to concentrate<br>Increased risk of accidents | Decreased mental well-being        |
| Lack of availability of separate space for teaching staff | Increased levels of stress<br>Low staff morale  |                                    |
| Need to address problems during supervision               | Increased levels of stress<br>Low staff morale  |                                    |
| Availability of staff for supervision                     | Difficulty in obtaining volunteers<br>Increased levels of stress<br>Low staff morale  | Decreased mental well-being        |

***Pupils going out at lunchtime***

Staff and other stakeholders identified a number of issues they thought are affected for teaching staff if pupils go out to eat at lunchtime. The results of whether these were considered to be beneficial or harmful are shown in Table 2.9. The effects and outcomes of these issues on teachers' health and well-being are shown in Table 2.10.

**Table 2.9: Potential impacts on teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy go out to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff**

|                                | <b>Staff</b> |
|--------------------------------|--------------|
| Noise levels                   | ☺            |
| Opportunity to take exercise   | ☺            |
| Break from school routine      | ☺            |
| Pupil behaviour outside school | ☹            |
| Pupil punctuality for lessons  | ☹            |

**Table 2.10: Outcomes for health and well-being of teaching staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy go out to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff**

| <i>Issue</i>                   | <i>Effects</i>   | <i>Outcomes for teaching staff</i>       |
|--------------------------------|--|--|
| Noise levels                   | Reduced levels of stress                               | Increased mental well-being              |
| Break from school routine      | Opportunity for relaxation<br>Reduced levels of stress |  |
| Opportunity to take exercise   | Increased levels of physical activity                  | Increased mental and physical well-being |
| Pupil behaviour outside school | Increased levels of stress and lower staff morale      | Decreased mental well-being              |
| Pupil punctuality for lessons  |  |  |

## 2.4 Potential impacts on catering staff

Impacts on catering staff have been presented using an ‘outcomes’ table that records the potential effects and outcomes on the health and well-being of catering staff for those issues thought to be important.

### ***Pupils staying in for school meals***

Staff and other stakeholders identified two main issues for catering staff if pupils stay in to eat school meals at lunchtime: capacity to provide a school meals service; and job security. Staff and other stakeholders felt that there was a potential negative impact on catering staff in terms of their capacity to provide a school meals service but a potentially positive impact on job security. The effects and outcomes of these issues on health and well-being of catering staff are shown in Table 2.11.

**Table 2.11: Outcomes for health and well-being of catering staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy stay in to eat school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others**

| <b><i>Issue</i></b>                      | <b><i>Effect</i></b>  | <b><i>Outcomes for catering staff</i></b> |
|--|---|---|
| Capacity to provide school meals service | Not enough capacity to provide school meals for all pupils<br>Increased levels of anxiety and stress and decreased staff morale | Decreased mental well-being               |
| Job security                             | Secure employment<br>Secure income<br>Reduced levels of stress  | Increased mental well-being               |

### ***Pupils going out at lunchtime***

Staff and other stakeholders identified the same issues for catering staff if pupils go out to eat at lunchtime with the opposite impacts to those identified if pupils stay in. The impact on catering staff’s ability to provide a school meals service was thought to be positive while the impact on job security was thought to be negative. The effects and outcomes of these issues on the health and well-being of catering staff are shown in Table 2.12.

**Table 2.12: Outcomes for health and well-being of catering staff if pupils at Eastbank Academy go out to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others**

| <b><i>Issue</i></b>                      | <b><i>Effect</i></b>  | <b><i>Outcomes</i></b>      |
|--|---|-----------------------------|
| Capacity to provide school meals service | Increased capacity to provide school meals for pupils who choose to stay in at lunchtime<br>Reduced levels of anxiety and stress and increased staff morale | Increased mental well-being |
| Job security                             | Increased risk of unemployment<br>Increased levels of anxiety and stress  | Decreased mental well-being |

## 2.5 Potential impacts on the local community, including businesses

### ***Pupils staying in for school meals***

Staff and other stakeholders identified several issues they thought that would affect the local community, including businesses, if pupils stay in to eat at lunchtime. Those that were considered

to be beneficial were: quality of environment; vandalism and antisocial behaviour; risk of road traffic and other accidents. Access to amenities (shops) was considered to be both beneficial and harmful. Impact on the local economy was considered to be harmful. The effects and outcomes of these issues on health and well-being in the community are shown in Table 2.13.

**Table 2.13: Outcomes for health and well-being of local community including businesses if pupils at Eastbank Academy stay in to eat school meals at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others**

| <b>Issue</b>                             | <b>Effects</b>  | <b>Outcomes</b>   |
|--|---|---|
| Local economy                            | Loss of business<br>Potential closure of some food and beverage vending sites             | <i>For owners:</i><br>Decreased mental well-being for owners of food and beverage vending sites (and employees if job losses) |
| Quality of environment                   | Reduced amount of litter and noise<br>Improved quality of environment                     | Increased mental well-being   |
| Vandalism and antisocial behaviour       | Reduced levels of vandalism and antisocial behaviour<br>Reduced levels of fear and stress |   |
| Access to amenities,                     | Increased access to amenities and reduced levels of stress in the short term              | <i>Short term</i><br>Increased mental well-being  |
|  | Decreased access to amenities if closure results from loss of business in the long term   | <i>Long term</i><br>Decreased mental well-being   |
| Risk of road traffic and other accidents | Decreased risk of road traffic and other accidents<br>Reduced levels of stress            | Increased mental well-being<br>Less likely to suffer physical injury  |

***Pupils going out to eat at lunchtime***

Staff and other stakeholders identified the same issues as important for the local community, including businesses, if pupils go out to eat school meals at lunchtime. The impact on the local economy was considered to be beneficial; the impact on the quality of environment, vandalism and antisocial behaviour, access to amenities (shops) and risk of road traffic and other accidents was thought to be harmful. The effects and outcomes of these issues on health and well-being of the local community are shown in Table 2.14.

**Table 2.14: Outcomes for health and well-being of local community, including businesses, if pupils at Eastbank Academy go out to eat at lunchtime according to issues identified by staff and others**

| <b>Issue</b>                             | <b>Effects</b>   | <b>Outcomes</b>  |
|--|--|--|
| Local economy                            | Increased income and profit from pupils at lunchtime<br>Creation of jobs at local food and beverage vending sites<br>Potential increase in the number of food and beverage vending sites | Increased mental well-being for owners and for employees             |
| Quality of environment                   | Increased amount of litter and noise<br>Reduced quality of environment   | Decreased mental well-being  |
| Vandalism and antisocial behaviour       | Increased levels of vandalism, antisocial behaviour, fear and stress   |  |
| Access to amenities,                     | Decreased access to amenities at lunchtime<br>Increased levels of stress<br><i>For vulnerable people, e.g. older people:</i><br>increased levels of social exclusion                     |  |
| Risk of road traffic and other accidents | Increased risk of road traffic and other accidents<br>Increased levels of stress   | Decreased mental well-being<br>More likely to suffer physical injury |

## 2.6 Potential impacts on parents

Very few impacts on parents and carers were identified during the HIA stakeholder workshop. In part, this may be because so few parents were able to attend. The one impact identified by the staff group on the health and well-being of parents and carers if pupils stay in to eat school lunches was improved mental well-being through reassurance that pupils were eating healthily and being supervised in a safe environment. Despite the relative lack of assessments regarding impacts on parents and carers in the workshop, several suggestions were made about involving parents with respect to improving pupils' lunchtime experience.

One potential impact on parents and carers that was discussed by the HIA team was the need to give their children cash for lunches when pupils are eating out and the effect this could have on the level of disposable income for families. In a study in Northern Ireland of the impact of poverty on children's experience of school, both children and parents cited lunches as one of the three main costs of school (uniform including shoes and school trips were the other two).<sup>13</sup> This issue could be explored further with parents.

<sup>13</sup> Joseph Rowntree Foundation (2007) The impact of poverty on young children's experience of school. Findings September 2007 – Ref 2146. <http://www.jrf.org.uk/findings/socialpolicy/2146.asp>

## 2.7 Discussion

Overall, more impacts on the health and well-being of pupils were identified than for any other group. This reflects the fact that pupils are the main clients for school meals, and that they are the primary target group for policies, strategies and action or implementation plans with respect to healthy eating in schools. However, in an HIA, it is recognised that other groups in the community or population also experience impacts and these also need to be addressed in addition to the impacts on pupils.

### ***Impacts on pupils***

On balance, pupils' assessment of the impacts of staying in to eat school lunches was negative. They identified negative impacts in relation to seven issues and positive impacts in relation to only four issues. In contrast, both the staff group and the group of other stakeholders identified a larger number of positive impacts than negative impacts for pupils staying in to eat lunch mainly by identifying several positive impacts in relation to issues that pupils either did not mention, recognise, value or were not aware of, such as access to the school nurse, exposure to role models and the opportunity to access a social space.

Pupils' assessment of going out to eat lunch was balanced in terms of positive and negative impacts on issues they identified as important. However, it was clear from pupils' responses that the issues that they felt that were positively affected by going out to eat were more highly valued than those that were affected negatively; that is, the pupils were prepared to experience the negative impacts and outcomes in order to enjoy the positives, such as freedom, independence and increased feelings of control. It is interesting that both the staff group and the group of other stakeholders identified more positive than negative effects for pupils if they went out to eat at lunchtime, but it should be noted that some of these positive impacts were experienced by the pupils who stayed in (for instance, reduced degree of crowding and noise levels for those staying in).

With respect to pupils eating out, only a few extra impacts were identified by staff and other stakeholders over and above those identified by the pupils. The other group of stakeholders saw the antisocial behaviour of a minority of pupils as having a negative impact on all pupils at Eastbank Academy because it gives rise to a poor image and reputation for the school in the local, and possibly the wider, community. The group of other stakeholders identified the opportunity for pupils to smoke when outside the school environment as negative for their long-term physical health, but they also recognised the desirability of smoking to pupils, through increased acceptance by peers, and for its symbolism in perceived attainment of adulthood.

### ***Impacts on teaching staff***

For the health and well-being of teaching staff, the assessment of impacts if pupils stayed in for lunch was negative overall in terms of the number of issues affected negatively (n=5). Some of these effects were experienced by the staff supervising lunchtime and some by all teaching staff. Only two positive effects were identified for teaching staff, one of which was experienced by staff supervising (a free meal) and the other by all teaching staff (improved pupil punctuality after lunch). On balance, the assessment of impacts on teaching staff if pupils go out for lunch was positive in terms of the number of issues affected positively (n=3) but some of this positive effect included the ability of teaching staff themselves to leave the school environment and take exercise.

### ***Impacts on catering staff***

For the catering staff, two issues were identified in the assessment. Job security was considered to be enhanced if pupils eat in, giving beneficial outcomes for both mental and physical well-being. The capacity to provide school meals service at lunchtime was affected negatively if too many pupils stayed in at lunchtime, which has harmful effects on the mental well-being of catering staff. The impact on each of these issues was identified as negative if pupils chose to eat out at lunchtime, i.e. catering staff would suffer through loss of job security but benefit from the mental well-being of knowing they have the capacity to provide meals for the pupils who choose to eat in.

Catering staff did not record which issue they valued more, but it is likely to be job security, which also has consequences for their families as well as themselves.

### ***Impacts on the community***

For the community, the impact of pupils eating out was considered to be negative according to four issues all related to the environment and pupil behaviour. The only positive effect identified was through the local economy (benefits of increased income and profit for local food vending sites – fixed or mobile). If pupils stayed in to eat, the assessment was opposite: the community benefited from no degradation to the environment but the local economy suffered from the loss of income and any other consequences that that entails.

### ***Areas of agreement and disagreement***

There were many areas of agreement about the potential impacts on health and well-being if pupils at Eastbank Academy stay in to eat school lunches. All stakeholder groups were in agreement that the dining room environment at Eastbank Academy was poor in terms of noise levels, the degree of crowding (due to lack of space), the furniture (seating and tables) and its layout, and that this impacted negatively upon pupils. Pupils and staff also identified problems with hygiene in terms of the unavailability of soap to wash hands leading to pupil perceptions that food may be contaminated by other pupils handling it.

All groups also acknowledged that the pupils' personal safety benefited by staying in to eat school lunches. In addition, the pupils recognised that the diet provided by school meals was healthy, as did the group of other stakeholders.

However, both the pupils and the group of other stakeholders disliked the supervisory presence of teachers – the pupils disliked the feeling of being watched, and this impact was echoed by the group of other stakeholders. The pupils did not appear to link the presence of supervisors as a way of increasing the personal safety of pupils.

As a corollary, the group of other stakeholders and the staff agreed that the duty of supervising lunchtime had a negative impact on the well-being on the supervisory staff involved as a result of the responsibility placed on staff of sorting out any problems that occur.

The staff saw the supervisory presence of teachers as positive for pupils because it provides the ability to deal with any fights that arise and the prospect of bullying, whereas the pupils and group of other stakeholders saw supervision as a negative because of the "Big Brother" effect.

It is noticeable that pupils at Eastbank Academy did **not** perceive staying in for school meals at lunchtime as an opportunity for social contact, whereas the staff and other stakeholders thought it did provide an opportunity for social contact. For pupils, the opportunity for social contact was afforded by leaving the school environment. The pupils' perception that staying in did not offer an opportunity for social contact is probably related to the poor environment in the dining area at Eastbank Academy (e.g. inadequate seating and table layout, crowding and noise levels).

With respect to pupils going out to eat, there was a great deal of agreement about the important issues and how they were affected. All stakeholder groups agreed about the positive effect on health and well-being of social contact with friends, and the choice of food and drinks, although pupils were also able to see the negative side of this (i.e. majority of choices were unhealthy). The group of other stakeholders were also in agreement with pupils about the positive effect of eating out through an opportunity to exercise and the freedom this provides.

All stakeholder groups agreed that pupils' personal safety was affected negatively when they left the school to eat, and the other group of stakeholders agreed with pupils on the negative effects through diet and food hygiene when eating food from an external vending site.

Pupils and the group of other stakeholders differed in their opinion about the impacts of going out in terms of exposure to the weather as a determinant of health. Under this determinant, pupils cited the negative, particularly getting wet in the rain, whereas the other group of stakeholders identified

the positive aspects of the weather particularly the exposure to ultraviolet light and the consequent increase in pupils' vitamin D levels. However, pupils did value "fresh air" as a positive impact but they perceived this as part of being able to leave the school environment and not as an aspect of being exposed to the weather.

## **2.8 Conclusions**

### ***For pupils***

In this report, we started the discussion by focusing on the impacts on pupils according to the issues they identified. The negative impacts they attribute to eating in school need to be addressed if a greater number of pupils are to be encouraged to use the school meals service at Eastbank Academy. Issues include temperature levels, noise levels, crowding, comfort and layout of seats and tables, lack of soap in combination with potential for fingering of food, current approach to supervision in the dining area and other pupils' behaviour.

It would appear that pupils are prioritising their immediate mental well-being at lunchtime over their long-term physical health. This is reinforced when examining the positive impacts they identified of going out at lunchtime where it is clear they value the ability to leave the school environment, the opportunity to exercise, the freedom and independence experienced, and the social contact with friends. The choice of food and drinks available was also cited as positive in terms of having a choice, and therefore control, but with respect to this issue they also recognised that, in general, the majority of choices available were unhealthy (and therefore had a negative impact on their physical and sometimes mental health).

It is important to emphasise that most of the pupils taking part in the HIA stakeholder workshop were able to identify negative impacts on both mental and physical health and well-being of making food choices that were unhealthy, and conversely the positive impacts on health and well-being of making food choices that were healthy. Therefore, for the majority of pupils, the issues that need to be addressed are not necessarily those to do with a lack of awareness about healthy eating. This finding is supported by an Ofsted study in which it was found that most pupils in schools had a good understanding of what constituted healthy eating but in many instances this knowledge had little bearing on the food they chose.<sup>14</sup>

### ***For teaching staff***

The impact on the health and well-being of teaching staff of pupils staying in to eat at lunchtime was overwhelmingly negative for their mental well-being, whether as supervisors or as a member of the teaching staff. One of the positive impacts that was identified probably has only a limited beneficial effect (a free lunch), and the other impact identified as positive (improved pupil punctuality) could never be wholly so because there will always be pupils who go out to eat at lunchtime who are likely to be late even if the uptake of school lunches increases.

If pupils go out to eat at lunchtime, the main benefits (mental and physical) seem to be experienced by staff who are not responsible for lunchtime supervision, whether inside or outside the school should there be any problems. The only benefit supervisory staff appear to gain is reduced noise levels, although from the site visit made by the HIA team, noise levels in the dining area were still relatively high despite the low numbers of pupils staying in to eat school meals. This is because the dining area also serves as the main thoroughfare to the only internal social space. However, the lack of pupil punctuality in returning to lessons after lunch affects a larger number of staff negatively, particularly with respect to mental well-being.

### ***For catering staff***

The impacts on catering staff were assessed in terms of only two issues. There are undoubtedly more issues that are important that will impact on their health and well-being. However, the issue of job security, which was highlighted in the assessment, is an important issue not only for

---

<sup>14</sup> Ofsted (2007) Food in schools. Encouraging healthy eating. October 2007. Reference no 070016

individual staff but also for their families. If the uptake of school meals continues to decline at Eastbank Academy, concerns about job security for catering staff will probably become predominant as opposed to any effects on mental well-being of the capacity to deliver a school meals service.

### ***For the local community including businesses***

In this assessment, the impacts on the community of pupils eating out were regarded as negative, especially in terms of individuals' mental well-being, as a result of being exposed to a littered and noisy environment, antisocial behaviour and vandalism by some pupils. Additional issues identified were the perception of being put at risk of accident, as well as experiencing reduced access to shops and other amenities. It is possible that vulnerable members of the local community such as older people may experience greater social isolation as a result of not wishing to be exposed to such conditions during the period of the pupils' lunch break.

The only benefit for the community was seen as the boost to the local economy, which could arguably increase the amount of disposable income circulating in the community and the possibility of creating new jobs. If a greater number of pupils decide to stay in to eat school lunches, this benefit will be reduced, but the community would not be exposed to as much litter or negative behaviour from pupils. As there were no members of the community or representatives from the external food vending sites in the HIA stakeholder workshop, it is not known which of these issues would be considered of greater value to them.

## **3. Stakeholder suggestions to improve health and well-being through the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy**

### **3.1 Introduction**

Participants were asked to identify ways to minimise any harmful or negative effects and enhance any beneficial or positive effects of the lunchtime experience for pupils at Eastbank Academy. Suggestions were made to improve the lunchtime experience for pupils who choose to stay in and eat school meals (see Table 3.1 on pages 24-26) and for pupils who choose to go out to eat at lunchtime (see Table 3.2 on page 27). Suggestions were made by the following groups:

- Younger pupils (S1, S2 and S3);
- Older pupils (S4, S5 and S6);
- Staff (teaching and catering);
- Other stakeholders.

### **3.2 Suggestions that pupils did not think would work with respect to the experience of eating in school**

Pupils, who are the main clients of the school meals service, thought that the following suggestions would not work if they were implemented to improve the lunchtime experience of pupils who choose to stay in and eat school meals.

- Staggered lunchtimes because different friends can be in different classes (younger pupils)
- Keeping pupils in for school meals by year class, e.g. on Tuesdays all 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> year pupils go for school meals at lunchtime, because it removes control from the pupil (younger pupils)
- Pupils working in the kitchen area, helping to cook and/or serve food (younger pupils)
- Removing chocolate from vending machines – this will force more pupils to go out (younger pupils)
- Removing carbonated drinks from vending machines – this will force more pupils to go out (younger pupils)
- Having a “golden” table – considered too babyish (younger pupils)
- Supervision by other pupils (older pupils)
- Formal consultation about menus that involves a specified time (younger pupils)
- Communicating about menus by ‘phone text (younger pupils)

**Table 3.1: Stakeholder suggestions to enhance health and well-being of pupils eating school meals**

|  | <i>Pupils</i> | <i>Staff</i> | <i>Others</i> | <i>Evidence base supports</i> | <i>Specific to Eastbank</i> |
|--|---------------|--------------|---------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <b><i>Dining environment</i></b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Improve type of seating (comfort) and tables (reduce size; round shape)  | √             |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| Improve layout of seats and tables   | √older        |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Remove existing furniture in concourse   |               |              | √             |                               | √                           |
| Use assembly area for dining – change the seats used for assembly  | √older        |              |               | √ stackable                   | √                           |
| Renegotiate janitorial duties with respect to setting up and clearing dining area if changes are made                      |               | √            |               |                               | √                           |
| Improve customer flow in and out of food selection   |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| Change flows for entry and exit in dining area   |               | √            |               |                               | √                           |
| Designate a special dining/social area   |               | √            |               |                               | √                           |
| Designate a separate social space for senior pupils  |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| Improve the content of what is broadcast on the TVs  | √older        | √            |               | √                             |                             |
| Ensure background music can be heard   | √older        |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Improve background music by allowing pupils to make the selection  | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Introduce other forms of entertainment, e.g. karaoke, musicians  |               | √            |               | √                             |                             |
| Establish outside eating area near dining hall with street furniture e.g. umbrellas  | √younger      |              |               |                               |                             |
| Introduce street furniture in school grounds   |               | √            |               |                               |                             |
| Use John Wheatley College building for meal provision  |               | √            |               | √                             | √                           |
| <b><i>Choice of foods &amp; menu development</i></b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Increase the number of vegetarian options  | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Include less healthy options sometimes, e.g. wedges  | √             |              |               |                               |                             |
| Have “theme” days (which could be linked to curriculum), e.g. Italian, Chinese, Indian, Turkish or American foods featured | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Have one day of the week where food is a “surprise”, e.g. on a Friday  | √older        |              |               |                               |                             |
| Celebrate occasions/festivals with appropriate foods, e.g. Halloween, Christmas, and Independence Day                      | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Introduce variety on menu from week to week  |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| Introduce new salad on a daily basis   |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| Have “taster” days with volunteers trying the “new” food choices   | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |

|   | <b>Pupils</b> | <b>Staff</b> | <b>Others</b> | <b>Evidence base supports</b> | <b>Specific to Eastbank</b> |
|---|---------------|--------------|---------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Involve pupils in the development of menus  | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| <b>Ordering system</b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Introduce a pre-ordering system for food, including hot food  | √younger      |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| <b>Consultation and feedback</b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Consult pupils about menus using (i) peer-led inquiry, (ii) informal conversation with teachers using storytelling techniques, (iii) open-ended anonymous questionnaires and (iv) comment boxes | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| <b>Payment and incentives</b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Introduce ability to pay with cash  | √younger      |              |               |                               |                             |
| Improve Q card system, e.g. finger scanning   | √younger      |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Introduce a prize for healthy eating  | √younger      |              |               | √                             |                             |
| <b>Hygiene</b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Re-introduce soap into pupils' toilets  | √             |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Introduce wet wipes at Fuel Zone  | √older        |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Catering staff to serve food rather than self-service   | √older        |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Identify ways to improve hygiene, e.g. soap and fingering of food, and pupils' perceptions, but keep self-service   | √younger      |              | √             |                               |                             |
| <b>Promotion of food choices on offer</b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Send menu home in advance   | √younger      |              |               | √                             | √                           |
| Announce specials on school intercom  | √older        |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Improve signage of menus  | √younger      |              |               | √                             | √                           |
| Re-name school meals provision (not Fuel Zone)  |               |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| <b>Supervision and management</b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Use popular teachers for supervision  | √older        |              |               | partly                        |                             |
| Provide "support" for pupils rather than supervision  |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| Provide more relaxed supervision while recognising need for discipline  | √younger      |              |               | partly                        |                             |
| Empower pupils to share supervision with staff  | Xolder        |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| Teaching staff to eat with pupils on a voluntary basis and find ways to make this enjoyable/a social event  |               |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| Use support staff for supervision   |               |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| Invite parents to participate   |               |              | √             | √                             |                             |

|   | <i>Pupils</i> | <i>Staff</i> | <i>Others</i> | <i>Evidence base supports</i> | <i>Specific to Eastbank</i> |
|---|---------------|--------------|---------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Attract members of the community to participate   |               |              | √             | √ if eat in                   |                             |
| <b><i>Encouraging uptake of school meals service</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Attract “influencers” among pupils and staff to eat school meals                                    |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| <b><i>Capacity to provide school meals service at Eastbank Academy</i></b>                          |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Stagger breaks for different pupil groups   | Xyounger      |              | √             | √                             |                             |
| Introduce different sittings for lunch  |               | √            |               |                               |                             |
| <b><i>Vending machines</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Have healthy choices in machines such as fruit  | √older        |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Introduce greater number of vending machines  | √younger      |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Introduce and maintain vending machines able to give change   | √younger      |              |               |                               |                             |
| <b><i>Whole school approach</i></b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Raise awareness of need for hand-washing with respect to food hygiene and eating                    | √younger      |              |               |                               | √                           |
| Work with curriculum as partner on food to encourage informed choice by pupils in and out of school |               | √            |               | √                             |                             |
| Serve food at lunchtime clubs   | √younger      |              |               | √                             |                             |
| Establish cookery clubs involving pupils and parents  |               | √            |               | √                             |                             |
| Introduce food and school meals as items for information and discussion at parents’ events          |               | √            |               | √                             |                             |
| Target P7 pupils and their parents at Open Day  |               | √            |               |                               |                             |
| Introduce school meals (Fuel Zone) at Induction Day   |               | √            |               |                               |                             |
| <b><i>School environment</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Provide separate social space for teachers to use at lunch and other times                          |               | √            |               |                               | √                           |
| <b><i>Costs and sources of funding</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Identify the cost implications of any changes and where they would fall                             |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| Fundraise to support any innovations  |               |              | √             | √                             |                             |

**Table 3.2: Stakeholder suggestions to enhance health and well-being of pupils who eat out at lunchtime**

|   | <i>Pupils</i> | <i>Staff</i> | <i>Others</i> | <i>Evidence base supports</i> | <i>Specific to Eastbank</i> |
|---|---------------|--------------|---------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <b><i>Environment</i></b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Increase the number of rubbish bins on street   | √             |              |               |                               | √                           |
| <b><i>Time available</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Increase the time available for lunch break   | √             |              |               | √ review                      |                             |
| <b><i>Liaison with parents</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Need to engage with parents about where pupils eat and what they are eating             |               | √            |               | √                             |                             |
| <b><i>Liaison with local food vendors</i></b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Discuss healthy eating issues with food vendors supplying pupils at lunchtime           |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| <b><i>Liaison with local community</i></b>  |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Attract participation by members of the local community                                 |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| <b><i>Supervision</i></b>   |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Enlist community officers to help manage the lunchtime experience for pupils eating out |               |              | √             |                               |                             |
| <b><i>Glasgow City Council responsibilities</i></b>                                     |               |              |               |                               |                             |
| Review licensing of food vendors in vicinity of schools                                 |               | √            |               |                               |                             |

#### 4. Assessor's observations

A far greater number of suggestions were made about improving the lunchtime experience if pupils stay in to eat school lunches (n=63) when compared with those made about improving the lunchtime experience if pupils go out to eat at lunchtime (n=7). There could be several reasons for this, including:

- The perception, of pupils at least, that there is little to improve about the lunchtime experience when eating out as opposed to staying in to eat school lunches;
- The lack of control and autonomy stakeholders believe they have over what happens in the external environment, although they may wish to see changes;
- The magnitude of the undertaking associated with suggestions, and the need for liaison and partnership working as well as advocacy and lobbying, appears to be greater for the majority of suggestions made about eating out when compared with those about eating in.

As for the findings from impact identification, the greatest number of suggestions were aimed at improving the health and well-being of pupils. Some suggestions were made that were aimed at or involved teaching and support staff, and a few were aimed directly at catering staff and parents or carers.

Of the suggestions which had pupils staying in to eat school lunches as their focus, the greatest number was made about improving the environment in the dining area (n=16), which reflects the generally acknowledged poor quality of that particular environment. The next most popular issues for suggestions were choice of food and menu development (n=9), supervision and management (n=8) and taking a 'Whole School Approach' (n=7).

Overall, the pupils made the most suggestions about ways to improve the lunchtime experience (n=35). Pupils' suggestions covered 10 out of 14 headings or categories in Table 4.1, which was the greatest spread of suggestions made by any stakeholder group at the HIA workshop. More

than half of the pupils' suggestions were supported by the findings of the rapid literature review (n=20), and a third addressed circumstances specific to Eastbank Academy (n=12). Three of the pupils' suggestions corresponded to a policy objective or an area for further consideration in Glasgow City Council's Food & Health Policy for Schools.

Most of the pupils' suggestions were about ways to improve the experience of staying in to eat school lunches, which reflects the generally negative experience they have at the moment. In terms of the number of suggestions, pupils appear to be most concerned about two issues with respect to eating school meals:

- The environment (n=7);
- The choice of food and menu development (n=7).

The next most popular suggestions made by pupils were:

- Hygiene (n=4);
- Promotion of food choices on offer (n=3);
- Payment and incentives (n=3);
- Vending machines (n=3).

Pupils also made suggestions about the ordering system, consultation and feedback, supervision and management, and taking a 'Whole School Approach.'

With respect to eating out, the two suggestions made by pupils involved improving the external environment by supplying more rubbish bins, which is specific to the circumstances around Eastbank Academy, and increasing the time available for the lunch break, a review of which is supported by findings from the rapid literature review. Ofsted recognises that this issue is particularly important in secondary schools.<sup>15</sup> It is also an area for further consideration in Glasgow City Council's Food & Health Policy for Schools.

Staff made the least number of suggestions overall (n=16), which probably reflects the issues of immediate concern to staff'. Just over two-fifths of staff suggestions were supported by findings in the rapid literature review (n=7), and just under a third were specific to the situation at Eastbank Academy (n=5). Only one staff suggestion corresponded to undertakings in the Glasgow City Council's Food & Health Policy for Schools.

Staff suggestions to improve the lunchtime experience for pupils who choose to stay in and eat school meals are presented below, ranked according to the number of suggestions made under each category or heading:

- Dining environment (7 suggestions);
- Whole School Approach (5 suggestions);
- Capacity to provide a school meals service at lunchtime (1 suggestion);
- School environment (1 suggestion).

With respect to improving the lunchtime experience for pupils going out to eat out at lunchtime, staff made two suggestions about the need to work with different groups of people or organisations:

- To engage with parents about where pupils eat and what they are eating – a suggestion supported by the findings of the rapid literature review;
- To work with DACS, to initiate discussions with Glasgow City Council about the licensing of food vendors in the vicinity of Eastbank Academy.

The group of other stakeholders made just over 20 suggestions overall to improve the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy (n=21), and these suggestions covered nine of the 14 categories or headings in Table 4.1. Half of these suggestions were supported by the findings of the rapid literature review (n=10), and one was specific to the situation at Eastbank Academy.

---

<sup>15</sup> Ofsted (2007) Food in schools. Encouraging healthy eating. October 2007. Reference no 070016

With respect to improving the lunchtime experience for pupils who stay in to eat school lunches, the group of other stakeholders made the most suggestions about:

- Supervision and management (n=6);
- Dining environment (n=4);
- Choice of foods and menu development (n=2);
- Costs and sources of funding (n=2).

Other suggestions covered, hygiene, the ordering system, the promotion of food choices on offer, encouraging the uptake of school meals, and the capacity to provide a school meals service at lunchtime.

With respect to improving the lunchtime experience of pupils eating out, the group of other stakeholders made three suggestions:

- Entering into discussion with local food vendors who supply pupils at lunchtime – a suggestion that corresponds to an area for further consideration in Glasgow City Council’s Food & Health Policy for Schools; this work could be undertaken in conjunction with other schools in Glasgow who are experiencing similar problems;
- Attracting members of the local community to participate;
- Enlisting the support of local community officers to manage the lunchtime experience for pupils eating out.

None of the stakeholder groups made specific suggestions about ways to improve the health and well-being of catering staff.

#### **4.1 Areas of agreement about eating in school**

There were many areas of agreement with respect to suggestions about improving the lunchtime experience for pupils who choose to stay in and eat school meals. [Agreement is defined as agreement among stakeholder groups and/or with the findings of the rapid literature review and/or with a policy objective or an area for further consideration in Glasgow City Council’s Food & Health Policy.] As some suggestions were made by only one stakeholder group, it is not possible for them to be in agreement with other stakeholder groups but it is possible for them to be in agreement with the findings of the rapid literature review. However, some suggestions are aimed at addressing the situation at Eastbank Academy, which may not be reflected in the findings of the rapid literature review due to their specificity.

##### ***Environment***

All groups of participants agreed on the need to improve the dining environment at Eastbank Academy with a variety of suggestions about how this could be done, some of which are specific to the situation at Eastbank where the dining environment is particularly poor. The pupils’ suggestions about improving the internal environment as one way of increasing the uptake of school meals are supported by the findings of the rapid literature review.

##### ***Choice of foods and menu development***

Most of the suggestions about how to improve the choice of foods and menu development were made by the pupils, and all but two of their suggestions are supported by the findings of the rapid literature review.

##### ***Ordering system***

Younger pupils and the group of other stakeholders were in agreement about establishing a pre-ordering system for hot food, which was supported by findings from the rapid literature review.

### ***Consultation and feedback***

Older pupils made several suggestions about ways to consult pupils about school meals. The need to consult pupils is supported by the findings of the rapid literature review. Younger pupils also identified what mechanisms would not work with respect to consulting pupils.

### ***Payment and incentives***

In the rapid literature review, it was found that incentive systems to encourage healthy eating are effective. Although there is an incentive system already in place at Eastbank Academy to encourage uptake of school meals (Q card linked to the Young Scot card), pupils reported several problems with that system, such as loss of cards, and therefore younger pupils made suggestions about improving the incentive system in place. This corresponds to a policy objective in Glasgow City Council's Food & Health Policy for Schools.

### ***Hygiene***

Hygiene was clearly an important issue for all pupils and their concerns resulted from a combination of several factors including a lack of soap in the toilets and the opportunity with self-service for pupils to finger food without buying it. This is likely to discourage uptake of school meals at Eastbank Academy and the suggestions made are aimed at addressing this specific situation. However, younger and older pupils made different suggestions about the style of service they wanted to see in order to address the issue.

### ***Promotion of food choices on offer***

Pupils made several suggestions about ways to promote the food choices on offer for school meals, all but one of which were supported by findings in the rapid literature review. Their interest in this issue probably arises from the fact that, at the moment, if pupils want to know what the special(s) of the day is (are) then they have to queue. Queuing was perceived as a negative impact especially if pupils then did not want the special of the day after they had spent time queuing). The group of other stakeholders also made a suggestion about promoting the food choices on offer, which was supported by the findings of the rapid literature review.

### ***Supervision and management***

All groups of participants agreed about the need for supervision during lunchtime if pupils at Eastbank Academy stay in to eat school meals. However, the type of supervision provided was key with different groups making different suggestions about how to achieve a style of supervision that was acceptable to pupils and might encourage increased uptake of school meals. Most of the general suggestions that were made are supported by the findings of the rapid literature review.

### ***Encouraging uptake of school meals***

The group of other stakeholders made a suggestion about a way of encouraging the uptake of school meals. This suggestion would be supported by information in the published literature if a social marketing approach was taken to increasing the uptake of school meals.

### ***Capacity to provide school meals service at Eastbank Academy***

The group of other stakeholders suggested staggering lunch breaks as a way of increasing the capacity to provide school meals but the younger pupils did not think this would work because different friends could be in different classes. The staff suggested different sittings, but the younger pupils might object to this suggestion for the same reason (although this suggestion was not made to them). Despite the support in the literature for the suggestions by staff and other stakeholders, neither is likely to be successful if the pupils at Eastbank Academy, who are the main clients, do not appear to be willing to support it.

### ***Vending machines***

The pupils made suggestions about the vending machines in the dining area, one of which is supported by findings in the rapid literature review, and corresponds to a policy objective in Glasgow City Council's Food & Health Policy for Schools, and one which probably arises as a result of the specific situation at Eastbank Academy (i.e. lack of space available).

### **Whole School Approach**

Several suggestions were made by staff and pupils about using a “Whole School Approach” to healthy eating. Most of these suggestions are supported by the findings of the rapid literature review, and the others are related to the specific situation at Eastbank Academy. This approach to healthy eating is one of the underpinnings for the Glasgow City Council’s Food & Health Policy for Schools.

### **School environment**

The facilities at Eastbank Academy for both staff and pupils are lacking in social spaces. Apart from addressing the needs of pupils, staff also suggested the provision of a separate space for them to use at lunchtime. This suggestion is supported by the findings of the rapid literature review.

### **Costs and sources of funding**

The group of other stakeholders were the only group to address the issue of the costs of providing a school meals service. The suggestion about fundraising to implement some of the suggestions is supported by the findings of the rapid literature review

## **4.2 Areas of disagreement**

There were very few areas of disagreement among stakeholders:

- Older pupils wanted to have a service where catering staff serve the food because of their concerns about hygiene. However, the younger pupils wanted to retain the self-service but requested an improvement in hygiene facilities to complement the retention of self-service, e.g. by providing soap for hand-washing and addressing the potential for pupils to finger food without buying it. It is clearly important for both the school and DACS to address the issue of hygiene at Eastbank Academy;
- Older pupils did not want to see supervision by pupils. However, the group of other stakeholders did make this suggestion, and it is supported by the findings of the rapid literature review. It is likely that older pupils did not want to be involved in supervision because of peer pressure;
- Younger pupils did not want staggered lunchtimes because it meant that they may not be able to see friends who are in different classes whereas staff and other stakeholders made this suggestion, which is supported by the findings of the rapid literature review;
- Younger pupils wanted to have the ability to pay for lunch using cash; they use cash for snacks during mid-morning break. In the findings of the rapid literature review, cashless systems were advocated by some in order to avoid the stigma attached to receiving free school meals for pupils who are eligible,<sup>16 17</sup> and in the Glasgow City Council Food & Health Policy for Schools, it is stated that cashless systems have reduced the stigma attached to free school meals. *Hungry for Success, A Whole School Approach to School Meals in Scotland*,<sup>18</sup> found that pupils do not regard stigma as a major reason for not taking free school meals, but still recommended the establishment of processes maximising anonymity for free meal recipients. One way to resolve this issue could be to run both types of payment option, i.e. pupils can choose whether they use a cash-based or a cashless system, although the feasibility of doing so would need to be reviewed.

---

<sup>16</sup> Ofsted (2007) Food in schools. Encouraging healthier eating. October 2007. Reference no 070016

<sup>17</sup> School Food Trust. A fresh look at the school meal experience.

<sup>18</sup> Her Majesty’s Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) (2002) *Hungry for Success. A Whole School Approach to School Meals in Scotland*. Final report on the Expert Panel on School Meals. The Stationery Office, Edinburgh.

### **4.3 Recommendations to improve the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy**

In summary, if the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy is to be improved and benefit health and well-being the following issues should be addressed:

#### ***Eating in school***

- Improve the internal dining environment;
- Complement the existing internal dining room environment by establishing other internal and external spaces for dining;
- Review arrangements for the supervision of the dining environment(s);
- Provide a separate space for relaxation of older pupils;
- Provide a separate space for relaxation of teaching staff
- Review the choices of food on offer and consulting pupils about menu development
- Consider trialling a pre-ordering system for hot food at lunchtime;
- Consider trialling payment for lunch by cash;
- Improve the incentive system already in place by replacing the Q card with another mechanism, such as finger scanning;
- Review the provision of soap for hand-washing in the toilets;
- Address both the potential for pupils to finger food in the self-service buffet without buying it, and the perception that food has been contaminated in this way;
- Implement pupils' suggestions about ways to promote school lunches;
- Find ways to attract 'influencers' in school (pupils and staff) to eat school lunches;
- Review ways to increase capacity to provide a school meals service at lunchtime at Eastbank Academy in accordance with demand;
- Review the number, content and operation of vending machines in the dining area;
- Take a Whole School Approach to increasing both the uptake of school lunches and to encouraging healthy choices about food and drink, reviewing the suggestions made and also assessing which of the interventions from the rapid literature review would be appropriate and effective at Eastbank Academy;
- Assess the cost implications of any changes to the school meals service at Eastbank Academy, the dining environment and initiatives to support healthy eating, and developing a fundraising strategy and action plan to help deliver those changes.

#### ***Eating out of school***

- Review the time available for the lunch break;
- Liaise with Glasgow City Council Environmental Services Department about the provision of litter bins and street cleaning/waste management on the Shettleston Road;
- Engage with parents and carers about what pupils are eating and where they choose to eat at lunchtime;
- Build on the initial engagement with local food vending businesses who supply Eastbank Academy pupils and discussing issues around healthy eating for children and young people;
- Build on links with the community to attract local people to participate in the lunchtime experience for pupils who eat out;
- Enlist the support of local community officers to help manage the lunchtime experience for pupils eating out.

## Appendix 1 Parameters of the rapid literature review and documents analysed

During the document analysis, influencing factors and interventions were identified according to the following categories:

- School meal at lunchtime;
- Dining room environment;
- Management and supervision of dining room arrangements;
- Relationships among various stakeholders and their involvement;
- Curriculum and extracurricular activities;
- Other aspects of the Whole School Approach;
- Tuck shop and vending machines;
- Breakfast and after school clubs.

The rapid review also included an analysis of the influencing factors and interventions relevant to packed lunches. However, this information was not used because so few pupils at Eastbank Academy bring packed lunches.

### Documents analysed

The following documents were analysed:

BMRB Omnibus prepared for School Food Trust (2006) Parents' Attitudes to School Food. Summary Report. August 2006.

food & health alliance. Children and young people. <http://www.fhascot.org.uk/faha/188.html>. Accessed 19 October 2007.

food & health alliance. Schools (health promotion and nutrition) (Scotland) bill. <http://www.fhascot.org.uk/faha/1109.html>. Accessed 19 October 2007.

food & health alliance. Schools (Health Promotion and Nutrition) (Scotland) Act. <http://www.fhascot.org.uk/faha/406.html>. Accessed 19 October 2007.

food & health alliance (2007) Looking back & moving forward. A celebration of the successes of the Scottish Diet Action Plan, 27 February 2007, Glasgow. Health Scotland.

Glasgow Centre for Population Health (GCPH) (2007) Healthy Food Provision and Promotion in Primary School: What impact is it having on food choices? Briefing Paper 1 Findings Series. GCPH.

Glasgow City Council (2004) Food & Health Policy for Schools.

Grant, I., Fischbacher, C. and Whyte, B. (2007) Obesity in Scotland. An epidemiology briefing. ScotPHO, Edinburgh.

Harper, C. and Wells, L. (2007) School meal provision in England and other Western countries: a review. May 2007. School Food Trust.

Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) (2001) Inspection of Standards and Quality in Eastbank Academy, Glasgow City Council. 17 April 2001.

Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) (2003) Follow-up to the Inspection of Eastbank Academy, Glasgow City Council. 25 March 2003.

Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) (2002) Hungry for Success: A Whole School Approach to School Meals in Scotland. Final Report of the Expert Panel on School Meals. November 2002. HMIE.

Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education (HMIE) (2005) Monitoring the Implementation of Hungry for Success: A Whole School Approach to School Meals in Scotland. Report on Progress October 2005. HMIE.

Lang, T., Dowler, E. and Hunter, D. J. (2006) Review of the Scottish Diet Action Plan. Progress and Impacts 1996-2005. September 2006. Health Scotland.

National Governors' Council and Food Standards Agency (2005 or later) Food Policy in Schools. A Strategic Policy Framework for Governing Bodies. National Governors' Council.

National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE) (2006). Guidance on the prevention, identification, assessment and management of overweight and obesity in adults and children, Quick Reference Guide 1. For local authorities, schools and early years providers, workplaces and the public. NICE.

National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (2007) Behaviour Change. Quick reference guide. NICE public health guidance 6. NICE.

Nelson, M. and Nicholas, J. (2006?) First annual survey of take up of school meals in England. School Food Trust.

Nicholas, J. and Wood, L. (2007) Schools Food Panel. First survey of head teachers – February 2007. School Food Trust.

Nicholas, J., Wood, L. and Nelson, M. (2007) Second annual survey of take-up of school meals in England. September 2007. School Food Trust.

Ofsted (2007) Food in schools. Encouraging healthier eating. October 2007. Reference no: 070016.

School Food Trust. A fresh look at the school meal experience

School Food Trust (2006 or later) Advice to Government on aspects of school food other than lunch.

School Food Trust (2007) Findings. Children's lunchtime choices following the introduction of food-based standards for school lunch; observations from six primary schools in Sheffield.

School Food Trust (2007) A fresh look at vending in schools. Updated with new 2007 regulations.

School Meals Review Panel (2005) Turning the Tables: Transforming School Food. Main Report. A report on the development and implementation of nutritional standards for school lunches. 29 September 2005.

Scottish Schools Online 2006. Eastbank Academy.  
<http://www.scottishschoolsonline.gov.uk/schools/eastbankacademyglasgowcity.asp?view=print>.  
Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Statistics. Best start for children – School Nutrition. High Level Summary of Statistics Last update: June 05, 2007. School Nutrition.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Statistics/Browse/School-Education/TrendsSchoolNutrition>.  
Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Schools. Top Ten Facts.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Statistics/Browse/Schools/top-ten-facts>. Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Schools. School meals.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/HLivi/schoolmeals> . Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Schools. Free school meals.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/HLivi/schoolmeals/free-school-meals> .  
Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Schools. Free fresh fruit.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/HLivi/schoolmeals/free-fruit> . Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Schools. Packed lunch guidance.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/HLivi/schoolmeals/guidance> . Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Government. Schools. Health Promotion and Nutrition Bill.  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Education/Schools/HLivi/schoolmeals/schoolsbill> . Accessed 19 October 2007.

The Scottish Office (1996) Eating for Health: a Diet Action Plan for Scotland.

## Appendix 2: Results of rapid literature review

### i) What influences whether children and young people (and parents/carers) make healthy choices about food?

| <b><i>School meals at lunchtime</i></b>  | <b><i>Dining room environment</i></b>   | <b><i>Management &amp; supervision of dining room arrangements</i></b>  | <b><i>Relationships among stakeholders &amp; their involvement</i></b>   | <b><i>Curriculum &amp; extra-curricular activities</i></b>   | <b><i>Other aspects of Whole School Approach</i></b>   | <b><i>Tuck shop &amp; vending machines</i></b>                             | <b><i>Breakfast &amp; after school clubs</i></b> |
|--|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| <p>Nutrition<br/>Choice<br/>Cost<br/>Portion size<br/>Presentation<br/>Quality<br/>Temperature<br/>Familiarity with available foods<br/>Availability of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 1<sup>st</sup> choice</li> <li>• 2<sup>nd</sup> helpings</li> <li>• water</li> <li>• bread</li> <li>• salt</li> <li>• other condiments</li> </ul> <p>Incentives to make healthy choices<br/>Availability of special diets for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• medical conditions</li> <li>• allergies/food intolerances</li> <li>• religious/ethnic reasons</li> </ul> <p>Proximity of other sources of food</p> | <p>Display of menus<br/>Layout<br/>Furniture<br/>Cleanliness<br/>Background music<br/>Lighting<br/>Décor<br/>Artwork<br/>Size of room<br/>Signage<br/>Uni/multi-function room<br/>Level of noise<br/>Cutlery<br/>"Crockery"<br/>Staff uniforms<br/>Branding</p> | <p>No. service points<br/>Management of queues<br/>Degree of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• crowding;</li> <li>• busyness</li> </ul> <p>Payment methods (including FSM)<br/>Length of time for lunch<br/>Amount of room<br/>Conduct<br/>Presence of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• teachers</li> <li>• supervisors</li> </ul> <p>Availability of guidance on food<br/>Possibility of pre-ordering<br/>Choice of seating</p> | <p>Consultation with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• pupils</li> <li>• parents</li> </ul> <p>Involvement of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• head teacher</li> <li>• other staff</li> <li>• parents/carers</li> <li>• school nurse</li> <li>• community dietician</li> <li>• local health development officer</li> </ul> <p>Relationship between:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• catering &amp; other staff</li> <li>• catering staff &amp; pupils</li> </ul> | <p>Clarity of message<br/>Consistency of message across curriculum<br/>PSE classes<br/>Food technology, including vocational courses<br/>Science<br/>Physical education<br/>Art<br/>Assembly<br/>"Golden time"</p> | <p>Policy<br/>Point of discussion for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• School Board</li> <li>• Staff</li> </ul> <p>Training for staff<br/>School literature</p> | <p>Availability of fruit<br/>Availability of snacks<br/>Use of profits</p> | <p>Eligibility<br/>Provision of food</p>         |

**ii) What has been done to help children and young people (and their parents/carers) make healthy choices about food?**

| <b><i>School meals at lunchtime</i></b>   | <b><i>Dining room environment</i></b>   | <b><i>Management &amp; supervision of dining room arrangements</i></b>   | <b><i>Relationships among stakeholders &amp; involvement</i></b>  | <b><i>Curriculum &amp; extra-curricular activities</i></b>  | <b><i>Other aspects of Whole School Approach</i></b>  | <b><i>Tuck shop &amp; vending machines</i></b>  | <b><i>Breakfast &amp; After School Clubs</i></b>  |
|---|---|--|---|---|---|---|---|
| <p>Food action group<br/>                     Food user group<br/>                     Consultation with pupils &amp; parents about menus, menu development &amp; menu planning<br/>                     Trialling of new menus<br/>                     Taster sessions of new menus<br/>                     Themed days, e.g. work with Modern Languages Dept on food from different countries<br/>                     Celebrate special days, e.g. birthdays<br/>                     Increasing amount of popular healthy foods<br/>                     Marketing/advertising of school meals<br/>                     Monitoring take-up of school lunches by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• catering staff</li> <li>• school council</li> </ul> <p>Ability to sit with friends eating packed lunches<br/>                     Time for extra-curricular activities after eating<br/>                     Menus sent home in advance<br/>                     Time to consider</p> | <p>Display menus in areas other than dining room e.g. class rooms<br/>                     Pupils choose soft background music<br/>                     Re-name dining room e.g. "bistro"<br/>                     Information displays on how to eat healthily<br/>                     Able to choose where and with whom you sit<br/>                     Acoustic sound panels/ceilings<br/>                     Soft vinyl flooring<br/>                     Soft furnishings including curtains<br/>                     Communication signs<br/>                     Table cloths &amp; table settings<br/>                     Stackable furniture if multi-use room<br/>                     Identity for dining room<br/>                     Visits to other dining areas to get inspiration</p> | <p>Reviewing length of lunch break<br/>                     Adjustments to timing of lunch<br/>                     Rota system<br/>                     Different sittings<br/>                     Staggered lunchtimes<br/>                     Cashless systems/pay-in-advance schemes<br/>                     Multiple food collection points<br/>                     Multiple payment points<br/>                     Parents as helpers in dining room<br/>                     Staff available to give guidance on food choices<br/>                     Food labelling<br/>                     Entertainment for those queuing<br/>                     Supervision of queues &amp; other arrangements<br/>                     Students as supervisors<br/>                     Eradicate "cross-points" for queues (to reduce confusion)<br/>                     Rules of conduct</p> | <p>Head teacher has relationship with catering staff<br/>                     Staff eat in dining room<br/>                     Parents/carers invited to lunch<br/>                     Other people from community invited to lunch<br/>                     Food as subject for parent evenings<br/>                     Work with parents/carers on common approach to healthy eating<br/>                     Provision of healthy food &amp; healthy eating message at curriculum consultation days<br/>                     Catering suppliers involved<br/>                     Local employers involved where vocational courses are in place<br/>                     Local councillor involved</p> | <p>Catering staff involved in lessons &amp; other activities<br/>                     Health coordinator appointed for school<br/>                     "Balance of good health" plate model used (not food pyramid)<br/>                     Link healthy eating to physical activity<br/>                     Cookery clubs<br/>                     Clubs for growing fruit &amp; vegetables (including unfamiliar vegetables)<br/>                     Food as subject for health fair<br/>                     Pupils observe catering staff at work<br/>                     Facilities for practical food-related</p> | <p>School Food Policy<br/>                     School Nutrition Action Group (SNAG)<br/>                     Health Promoting School status or healthy school coordinator<br/>                     Food is a development plan priority<br/>                     Food is agenda item for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• School Board</li> <li>• staff meetings</li> </ul> <p>Food as subject for staff development days<br/>                     Food as item in staff handbook<br/>                     Governor appointed to oversee developments in healthy eating<br/>                     All staff entitled to professional development</p> | <p>Market stall<br/>                     Consultation with pupils &amp; parents on what to sell<br/>                     If no breakfast club, tuck shop can be used to ensure pupils who have had no or little breakfast can access food in morning<br/>                     Pupils help to set prices (to increase affordability)<br/>                     Choice in tuck shop overlaps with lunchtime (to reduce queues &amp; increase time for extra-curricular activity)<br/>                     Healthy options for vending machines<br/>                     Taste trials for contents of vending</p> | <p>Invite parents to Breakfast Club (BC)<br/>                     Link other support for pupils to BC</p> |

|  |   |   |  |   |   |  |  |
|--|---|---|--|---|---|--|--|
| <p>menus<br/> “Meal deals”<br/> Attractive food presentation<br/> Free raw vegetable sticks while queuing<br/> Masterchef competition with winning menus cooked as school meals<br/> Working lunches for particular groups, e.g. sports clubs<br/> Working together with other schools in a related group<br/> Visit other schools to see what they have done<br/> Business plan to underpin developments<br/> Surveying pupils<br/> Incentive schemes to reward healthy eating<br/> Catering for cultural, medical and special food needs</p> | <p>Displays of pupils’ artwork<br/> Dimmable lighting<br/> Adjustable blinds<br/> Temperature controls<br/> Repainting walls<br/> Zoning of dining room space<br/> Mix of seating and table heights<br/> Competitions to design menus</p> | <p>posted in dining room<br/> Effective arrangements for pupils receiving free school meals (guaranteed anonymity), e.g. cashless system where all pupils have a card &amp; personal PIN no.<br/> Best table award<br/> Special arrangements for pupils wanting to participate in lunch-time activities<br/> Mobile food servers<br/> Use of extra indoor space<br/> Use of classrooms as eating area<br/> Buddy systems to support younger pupils<br/> Remuneration of lunchtime supervisors</p> | <p>Attract sponsorship from local businesses to fund changes<br/> Fundraising in local community to make changes</p> | <p>activities<br/> Practical experience of preparing food<br/> Link food projects to other budgets<br/> Pupil enterprise activities linked to food<br/> Reviewing timetabling of extra-curricular activities (to avoid conflicts with eating)</p> | <p>Training for all staff in SEAL methodology (social and emotional aspects of learning)<br/> Training for catering staff<br/> Food in school handbook<br/> Food features in school newsletter<br/> Healthy food used as reward for pupils<br/> Studies, e.g. pupils keeping food diaries together with analysis of food intake &amp; comparison with pupils’ behaviour</p> | <p>machines<br/> Changing range of products in vending machines (to maintain interest)<br/> “Meal deals” for vending machines<br/> BOGOF for vending machines<br/> Promotions for vending machines</p> |  |
|--|---|---|--|---|---|--|--|

### Appendix 3: Programme

|   |
|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Health Impact Assessment (HIA) of Food in Glasgow Secondary Schools:<br/>Eastbank Academy</b></p> |
|---|

**Programme**

- 0930 Welcome & introduction to the day's events – David Parry, Glasgow City Council**
- 0945 Participants introduce themselves to each other – exercise led by HIA facilitator**
- 1000 Introduction to HIA, and to the HIA of Food in Glasgow Secondary Schools: Eastbank Academy – HIA facilitator**
- 1015 Food, its effect on health and how it relates to other factors that affect health – exercise led by HIA facilitator**
- 1030 Why don't some young people eat school meals, and go elsewhere? – small groups led by group facilitators**
- 1100 Break for refreshments**
- 1115 Identifying the impacts on health of the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy – small groups led by group facilitators**
- 1200 Feedback from group work**
- 1230 LUNCH**
- 1300 Identifying ways to increase the health benefits from the lunchtime experience at Eastbank Academy, and ways to reduce what people see as disadvantages – small groups led by group facilitators**
- 1345 Feedback from group work**
- 1415 Discussion about how the results of the HIA could be taken forward – led by HIA facilitator**
- 1445 Closing exercise – led by HIA facilitator**
- 1455 Closing remarks**

## Appendix 4 Stakeholder responses to the task “How does food affect your health?”

### **Positive impacts**

Gives you energy  
Satisfaction  
Gives you life  
Tasty  
Purpose  
Nutritional value  
Children’s development  
Positive effect of appearance  
Social Experience  
Can be exciting  
Nutrients  
Special treats, sometimes spoiling yourself  
Strength  
Immunity  
Sharing  
Sociable, used to celebrate  
Can be fun to cook  
Vitamins  
Personal well-being  
Vitamin C – helps your body  
Good skin  
Calcium makes your bones strong  
Appearance  
Entertainment  
Chocolate is good for energy and keeps you awake  
Feel good

### **Positive impacts continued**

Growth  
Mental Health  
Feel better  
Food can be fun  
Makes you feel good  
Enables your organs/body to function  
Improves concentration  
Positive attitude  
Behaviour  
Teeth and bones (good oral health)  
Fitness  
Can be fun to share  
Comfort  
Hottens your throat  
Pleasure  
Can be comforting (soup on a cold day or chocolate)  
Some foods don’t use artificial colourings and flavourings  
Interesting  
Some foods (porridge) gives you a steady balance of energy  
Good provides body heat  
Gives healthy skin, reduces illnesses (cancer)  
Gives you control – you can choose what you want to eat  
Good food removes hunger

### **Negative impacts**

Chocolate is bad for the teeth  
Guilt  
If you eat too much salt, you can have a heart attack or a stroke  
Mixed messages  
Boring  
Waste  
Shopping  
Availability  
Time  
Cost  
Greasy hands  
No energy  
Ill  
Energy  
If you eat too much good you can become fat!  
Overindulgence  
Makes you sluggish  
Sugar rots your teeth  
Crabs!  
Concentration  
Anti-oxidants  
Can be prone to illnesses  
Obesity  
Spots  
Eating bad food can make you tired and weary  
Too much food is uncomfortable